

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
WAYNE SCHRADER (SBN 67447)  
WSchrader@gibsondunn.com  
THEODORE J. BOUTROUS JR. (SBN 132099)  
TBoutrous@gibsondunn.com  
MARK A. PERRY (SBN 212532)  
MPerry@gibsondunn.com  
GEORGE BROWN (SBN 138590)  
GBrown@gibsondunn.com  
MAURICE SUH (SBN 147485)  
MSuh@gibsondunn.com  
KARL NELSON (*pro hac vice*)  
KNelson@gibsondunn.com  
G. CHARLES NIERLICH (SBN 196611)  
GNierlich@gibsondunn.com  
JULIAN W. POON (SBN 219843)  
JPoon@gibsondunn.com  
JAIME DODGE BYRNES (SBN 237991)  
JByrnes@gibsondunn.com  
555 Mission St., Ste. 3000  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Tel: (415) 393-8200  
Fax: (415) 393-8306

Attorneys for Defendant  
WAL-MART STORES, INC.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE WAL-MART STORES, INC.  
WAGE AND HOUR LITIGATION

CASE NO. C 06-02069 SBA

**CLASS ACTION**

**ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO  
CONSIDER WHETHER CASES SHOULD  
BE RELATED**

This Document Relates To:

Case Nos.:  
C 06-02069 SBA (Smith) and  
C 06-05411 SBA (Ballard)

**TO THE COURT AND ALL PARTIES AND COUNSEL OF RECORD IN ALL  
RELATED CASES:**

**PLEASE TAKE NOTICE** that, pursuant to Civil Local Rules 3-12 and 7-11, Defendant Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. (“Wal-Mart”), hereby submits this Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Cases Should be Related on the grounds that the following three cases are related within the meaning of Civil Local Rule 3-12:

- *Bryan, et al. v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., et al.* (“Bryan”), N.D. Cal. Case No. CV 08-05221 SI
- *Rubin v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.* (“Rubin”), N.D. Cal. Case No. CV 08-4214 SBA
- *In re Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., Wage and Hour Litigation* (“Smith/Ballard”), N.D. Cal. Case Nos. C 06-02069 SBA & C 06-05411 SBA

*Bryan* is a civil action currently pending in the Northern District of California before the Honorable Susan Illston. Wal-Mart’s registered agent for service of process was served with the complaint in *Bryan* on or about October 21, 2008. *See* Declaration of G. Charles Nierlich (“Nierlich Decl.”) **Exhibit A**. On November 19, 2008, Wal-Mart removed the Bryan action to the United States District Court for the Northern District of California. *See* Nierlich Decl. **Exhibit B**. *Smith/Ballard* is a civil action currently pending before this Court. *See* Nierlich Decl. **Exhibit C**. *Smith/Ballard* was initially filed as two separate actions, and then consolidated by this Court, long before the complaint in *Bryan* was filed.

This Administrative Motion is made pursuant to Civil Local Rule 3-12(a), which provides that actions are related when:

- (1) The actions concern substantially the same parties, property, transaction, or event; and
- (2) It appears likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different judges.

On November 11, 2008, this Court granted defendant Wal-Mart’s Administrative Motion To Consider Whether *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard* Should Be Related and transferred *Rubin* to this Court. As Wal-Mart explained in that administrative motion, both *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard* involve substantially the same parties. Wal-Mart is a defendant in both cases, and both cases purport to be

brought by an overlapping class of plaintiffs, namely, former employees of all Wal-Mart stores in the State of California. Additionally, both *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard* appear to involve substantially similar events and claims. In each case, the overlapping putative class alleges that Wal-Mart has supposedly miscalculated the amount of monies that Wal-Mart allegedly owes plaintiffs, and that Wal-Mart has supposedly failed to timely pay plaintiffs upon their terminations. Consequently, this Court granted Wal-Mart's Administrative Motion and related *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard*.

For similar reasons, *Bryan* is also related to *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard* within the meaning of Civil Local Rule 3-12. *Bryan* involves substantially the same parties as *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard*. Wal-Mart is a defendant in all three cases. Moreover, plaintiffs in *Bryan* purport to bring suit on behalf of a subset of current and former employees of Wal-Mart in California – employees who drove trucks for Wal-Mart. Additionally, plaintiffs in *Bryan* make similar claims to those at issue in *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard*. They allege that Wal-Mart failed to provide its truck drivers with meal and rest periods and failed to pay them certain wages pursuant to California law. Consequently, it seems likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense and/or the possibility of conflicting results if *Bryan* is conducted before a different Judge than *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard*.

Pursuant to this Court's standing orders, counsel for Wal-Mart has attempted to meet and confer with counsel for plaintiffs in both the *Smith-Ballard* and *Bryan* actions concerning this Administrative Motion. Nierlich Decl., ¶ 7. As of the date this Administrative Motion was filed, counsel for the *Bryan* plaintiffs had not stated a position on the Motion. *Id.* Counsel for the *Smith-Ballard* plaintiffs has stated that they intend to oppose this motion. *Id.*

Defendant Wal-Mart respectfully requests that this Court grant this Administrative Motion, that the *Bryan* action be deemed related to the *Rubin* and *Smith/Ballard* actions, and that the *Bryan* action be transferred to this Court for further proceedings based on such relatedness.

DATED: January 12, 2009

Respectfully submitted,

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

By: /s/G. Charles Nierlich  
G. Charles Nierlich

Attorneys for Defendant WAL-MART STORES, INC.

## DECLARATION OF SERVICE

I, Robin McBain, declare as follows:

I am employed in the County of San Francisco, State of California; I am over the age of eighteen years and am not a party to this action; my business address is 555 Mission St., Ste. 3000, San Francisco, California 94105, in said County and State. On January 12, 2009, I served the within:

### ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO CONSIDER WHETHER CASES SHOULD BE RELATED; DECLARATION OF G. CHARLES NIERLICH IN SUPPORT THEREOF

to the *Smith-Ballard* parties as follows:



**BY ECF (ELECTRONIC CASE FILING):** I e-filed the above-detailed documents utilizing the United States District Court, Northern District of California's mandated ECF (Electronic Case Filing) service on January 12, 2009. Counsel of record are required by the Court to be registered e-filers, and as such are automatically e-served with a copy of the documents upon confirmation of e-filing.

I also served the within to the below-listed parties as follows:



**BY U.S. MAIL:** I placed a true copy in a sealed envelope addressed to the below-named parties, on the above-mentioned date. I am familiar with the firm's practice of collection and processing correspondence for mailing. It is deposited with the U.S. Postal Service on that same day in the ordinary course of business. I am aware that on motion of party served, service is presumed invalid if postal cancellation date or postage meter date is more than one day after date of deposit for mailing in affidavit.

#### Attorneys for *Smith-Ballard v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.* Plaintiffs

Louis M. Marlin  
Stanley D. Saltzman  
MARLIN & SALTZMAN  
3200 El Camino Real, Ste. 100  
Irvine, CA 92602  
Telephone: (714) 669-4900

Stanley D. Saltzman  
MARLIN & SALTZMAN  
29229 Canwood St., Ste. 208  
Agoura Hills, CA 91301  
Telephone: (818) 991-8080

Peter M. Hart  
PETER M. HART LAW OFFICES  
13952 Bora Bora Way, Ste. F-320  
Marina del Rey, CA 90292  
Telephone: (310) 478-5789

Arnold Schwartz  
SCHWARTZ, DANIELS & BRADLEY  
29229 Canwood St., Ste. 208  
Agoura Hills, CA 91301  
Tel: (310) 478-5838

Susan Simmons Seemiller  
BAILEY PINNEY PC  
840 County Square Dr.  
Ventura, CA 93003  
Telephone: (805) 339-9090

Bonnie R. MacFarlane  
BAILEY PINNEY PC  
720 Howe St., Ste. 113  
Sacramento, CA 95825  
Telephone: (800) 230-5528

**Attorneys for Rubin v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. Plaintiffs**

Alan Harris  
HARRIS & RUBLE  
5455 Wilshire Blvd., Ste 1800  
Los Angeles, CA 90036-4201  
Telephone: (323) 931-3777

David S. Zelenski  
HARRIS & RUBLE  
5455 Wilshire Blvd., Ste 1800  
Los Angeles, CA 90036-4201  
Telephone: (323) 931-3777

**Attorneys for Bryan v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. Plaintiffs**

Andrew B. Jones  
WAGNER & JONES LLP  
1111 East Herndon, Ste. 317  
Fresno, CA 93720  
Telephone: (559) 449-1800

I certify under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct, that the foregoing document(s) were printed on recycled paper, and that this Declaration of Service was executed by me on January 12, 2009, at San Francisco, California.

/s:/ Robin McBain  
Robin McBain

100563883\_1.DOC